

## **Rosa Mystica**

### **An Analysis of the alleged apparitions to Pierina Gilli Montichiari 1947 and Fontanelle 1966, Italy**

#### The Apparitions

In Montichiari, Northern Italy, a nurse, Pierina Gilli had a vision of Mary in 1947.

The Virgin was dressed in purple and three swords stuck out of her chest. The first sword was for priests saying mass in a state of rebellion against God or mortal sin, the second stood for the giving up of a religious vocation and the third stood for people selling out on the true faith.

But God is infinitely good and must hate all sin infinitely so all sin is mortal or infinitely evil. What does she expect these priests to do when the Church says that we sin all the time?

The Lady said three words, "Prayer, sacrifice or penance". This alone contains a significant error for sacrifice and penance are the same thing!

In July, Gilli had another vision. Mary told her that she was sent by God to reveal a new form of devotion to Mary that would increase vocations and saintliness in religious orders. But the orders must have prayed well at one time so this new remedy would be pointless. The Lady is denying that God is good for quality not quantity would be what is important to him.

The devotion was that the 13th day of every month would be devoted to Mary and for that day specific prayers had to be said for 12 days in preparation. The Lady went on to say that the 13th day of July was to be dedicated to the veneration of Mary under the title of the Mystical Rose. The 13th day is an echo of Fatima and suggests approval of it for Mary appeared on the thirteenth day for six months.

Lucia of Fatima claimed that Mary revealed the devotion of the Five First Saturdays to her. St Margaret Mary said that Jesus revealed the devotion of the nine First Fridays to her. Then you have the Divine Mercy Devotion of Sister Faustina which gives further devotions. It is hard to believe that when those three people revealed these devotions and got approval from the Church that Mary would appear with more devotions. Even three is too much. Gilli may have wanted the fame from being associated with instituting a popular new devotion.

Gilli sought to learn if the Lady would do a miracle soon. The Lady said that the most obvious miracle would be the sanctification of religious who had fallen into sin and indifference. They would stop offending Jesus. This implies that any healing miracle in response to devotion to her must be false for it would be a more obvious miracle than an alleged conversion. Does Mary not know that all false apparitions result in some conversions? The Church says that that God offers the grace of conversion at all times and does what is best so they have to happen and do not prove that God approves of the apparition. The absurdity of the revelation shows that it came from Pierina herself and not Mary.

Needless to say, the miracle never happened. The church is worse now that it has been for years. Vocations to the religious life are rare. It is no use to say that it will happen for a miracle is needed to prove that the apparitions are true and a miracle promised in a vision comes before one that is not. Would Mary come to try and avoid the unavoidable? No way. And a minor apparition that few know of is not trying. Why didn't she come down and go in style like she did at Fatima? And the crisis in the Church is God's fault for he is all-powerful.

Devotees say the promise was not broken for its fulfilment depended on our compliance with her demands and so it was us who prevented it from being done. But the Virgin must have been sure that it would be visibly fulfilled when she gave it as a sign. To say, "This sign is the evidence for my apparition but if it comes to pass or not depends on you", is to offer evidence that is not evidence and is to talk rubbish.

In the fourth apparition, Mary said that the Lord cannot look upon sins of impurity and wants to punish them. But she asked him to refrain once more. She also asked that these sins be atoned by prayer and by penance.

How would God who wants only to do what is right, namely punish people, do what must be wrong to please Mary? Who is God in Heaven – him or her?

The sixth apparition proved that the apparitions were hoaxes for it spoke of Fatima as authentic and approved by God.

On the feast of the Immaculate Conception, December 8th, the seventh vision of Montichiari, took place. Mary said, "I am the Immaculate Conception," and called herself the mother of God. She requested that the Pope, Pius XII, declare an Hour of Grace for the World to be held every 8th December at noon. And she blessed the tiles in the Church saying that to whoever repents and prays on them they will be a ladder to Heaven and to grace. By the way, the Church does not like the idea of Mary being said to give blessings like that for they are restricted to priests. She said that Jesus was restraining his desire to punish because of her intercession. She told Gille a secret which was to be revealed by the Church when she returned.

The Virgin would not tell a secret which is holding back something that might play an important role in determining if the visions came from God or not.

The long-awaited return of the Lady took place in April 1966 at Fontanelle. It takes no genius to work out how she came back to – that's right, Pierina Gilli. The Lady blessed a spring. The Lady said that the sacraments had the power to make a soul stained with sin beautiful again. So, God refuses to make peace with you until you receive a priestly rite as if going to the priest is more important than loving him! She asked for the wheat of a chosen field to be turned into communion wafers. The wheat was to be taken to Paul VI. Paul VI was a disaster for the Church and the real Mary would have chastised him instead of sending him a gift from a field that did not even belong to her.

There is no evidence that Mary really appeared to this Lady. Cures attributed to the vision are less impressive when the cured prayed to a lot of other supernatural beings too and none of them were declared miraculous.

### Analysis of the Messages

The Virgin said, "I have placed myself as the Mediatrix between my Divine son and mankind, especially for the soul consecrated to God."

Correct Catholic teaching says that Mary is not an intermediary between Jesus and his people on earth. He is the intermediary between God and us and he shares some of this role with her. She is at his side.

The message implies that Mary cares more about the souls of priests and monks and nuns than anybody else. She is like a spiritual snob.

The following suggests that priests must stop people sinning sexually rather than people deciding to do it for themselves.

"Our Lord can no longer watch the many grievous sins against purity. He wants to send a flood of punishments. I have interceded that He may be merciful once more! Therefore, I ask for prayer and penance to atone for these sins.... I lovingly ask the priest to express their great love and stop the people from committing those sins. Whoever will atone for those sins, will receive my blessing and graces."

"What do we have to do to fulfil your demands for prayer and penance?" asked Pierina. The apparition of Mary answered, "Prayer." This is a very strange answer. She should have said, "Be open to God's grace and you will find yourself praying and doing penance". That fits Catholic teaching. In fact the strange answer implies that we depend on prayer not on the grace of God. Some people pray without caring about divine grace.

"This Hour of Grace will produce great and numerous conversions. Hardened and cold hearts resembling this marble will be touched by divine Grace, and they will become faithful to Our Lord in loyal love."

"Our Lady appeared on a large white staircase, decorated with a white, red and yellow rose. She said with a smile: 'I am the Immaculate Conception.' And descending several steps with great majesty She continued: 'I am Mary, full of grace, Mother of My Divine Son Jesus Christ.' Descending even more, She said: 'Through my coming to Montichiari, I wish to be known as the ROSA MYSTICA. It is my wish that every year, on 8th December, at noon, the HOUR OF GRACE FOR THE WORLD be celebrated . Many divine and bodily graces will be received through this devotion.' "

Mary seems very full of herself here to be a holy woman! She is very showy!

The apparition didn't help the cause of Catholic mysticism at all. In fact she never gave any helps in the mystical life. It is impossible to believe that the apparition of Mary under the title of Mystical Rose would fail to do what this title implied she should do. The devotion she wants is based on prayer and penance. She says nothing more than that. She keeps it very superficial and therefore unhelpful.

One should very soon notify the Holy Father of the Church, Pope Pius XII, that it is my wish that the HOUR OF GRACE FOR THE WORLD be made known and spread throughout the world." Mary supposedly said this but we will see that the allegedly humble visionary was saying it and courting approval and fame through her claims.

The real Mary would know if there was a good chance of Pius granting approval. There was none. The apparition never got enough fame to make that possible. Instead of her seeking approval of the apparitions from the Church, she would not mention the subject. She would let things run their course and trust that God has the power to get them approved.

Further apparitions took place Fontanelle.

Mary supposedly appeared to bless a spring, "My Divine Son is total love, and he is sending me to give miraculous powers to this spring."

This implies that miracles do not come straight from God. God has miracle powers not water. He cannot give water his power. He can only bless if it is used but that is not the same thing. She is advocating superstition and occultism.

"My Divine Son Jesus has sent me again, in order to request the WORLD LEAGUE OF PENITENTIAL COMMUNION and this is to be done on 13th October. This Day of Penitential Communion should be spread throughout the world. It is to be held first in 1966, and then to be repeated every year."

If Mary really said this then God would have ensured that it would have happened in 1966. It didn't.

The apparitions of the Mystical Rose are not from Heaven.

 [Print Friendly and PDF](#)