

KNOCK VISION IS SUSPECT FOR LIES TOLD ABOUT THE RAIN AND IT WAS NOT VIEWED PROPERLY

Source: 1879 Depositions of Witnesses of "Apparition" of Mary, Joseph, John and angels on the gable of Knock Chapel.

After the reported two hour apparition, depositions were taken from the witnesses. There are clues in those statements. Was it a miracle or paranormal or something more natural?

UNDERLINED TEXT AT FACE VALUE INDICATES THE SUPERNATURAL OR INEXPLICABLE

THE BOLDED TEXT IS CLEAR EVIDENCE OF THE MAGIC LANTERN THEORY OR A NON-MIRACLE

THE REST DOESN'T INDICATE ONE WAY OR THE OTHER

THERE ARE FAR MORE BOLDED INDICATING THAT THE EVIDENCE FAVOURS A NATURAL INTERPRETATION

			MIRACLE	CLOSE UP VIEW
WITNESS	RAINING	SPARKLE	DRY	
			GABLE	
1 Patrick Hill	All the time		Not mentioned For the space of one hour and a half we were under the pouring rain ... I noticed that the rain did not wet the figures. The figures staying dry would be expected if they were projections from a magic lantern.	YES
WEEKLY NEWS 1880				When asked if he could touch he strangely does not answer but says instead that an old woman tried to touch the Virgin's feet. Says he was at a distance.
DAILY TELEGRAPH 1880				YES
WITNESS	RAINING	SPARKLE	MIRACLE	CLOSE UP VIEW
			DRY	
			GABLE	
			Not clear. She says the gable had a	

Created by free version of DocuFreezer

2 Mary McLoughlin	Yes - but does not say it rained all the time	Yes - like little stars. Was the rain interfering with the light source?	dry appearance. A wall can look dry at night when it is lit up. She was only saying it looked dry not that it was dry. Even if it was dry, that may not have been a miracle in her view for she didn't say it rained all the time. "I was outside the ditch and to the south-west of the schoolhouse near the road."	NO - she stayed at the ditch
WITNESS	RAINING	SPARKLE	MIRACLE DRY GABLE	CLOSE UP VIEW
3 Mary Beirne	All the time	Yes - like little stars		
WEEKLY NEWS 1880				
1932 Testimony - not under oath	Yes			
1935 testimony to Liam Ua Cadhain				
1936 deathbed sworn statement for Commission				
WITNESS	RAINING	SPARKLE	MIRACLE DRY GABLE	CLOSE UP VIEW
4 Patrick Walsh	Yes - but does not say it rained all the time			NO

			MIRACLE	
WITNESS	RAINING	SPARKLE	DRY	CLOSE UP VIEW
			GABLE	
5				
Patrick Beirne				
1932 Testimony				
1936 Sworn statement	Heavy drizzle			
			MIRACLE	
WITNESS	RAINING	SPARKLE	DRY	CLOSE UP VIEW
			GABLE	
6	Yes - but does not say it rained all the time but only at the time she went to see the vision			
Maggie Beirne				
			MIRACLE	
WITNESS	RAINING	SPARKLE	DRY	CLOSE UP VIEW
			GABLE	
7				
Dominick Beirne				Says the eyes of the images could be seen so YES
			MIRACLE	
WITNESS	RAINING	SPARKLE	DRY	CLOSE UP VIEW

			GABLE	
8				NO
Mrs Flatley				
			MIRACLE	
WITNESS	RAINING	SPARKLE	DRY	CLOSE UP VIEW
			GABLE	
9		Yes	<u>Yes - the wind blew the rain in the direction of the gable but the gable remained dry as did the ground underneath the vision. Another miracle is how if the gable and the ground were really dry, why some visionaries didn't stand against it to get shelter from the rain! Also why did people stand at the south gable of the school house to get all the rain and wind?</u>	YES
Bridget Trench				
			MIRACLE	
WITNESS	RAINING	SPARKLE	DRY	CLOSE UP VIEW
			GABLE	
10				
Catherine Murray				
WEEKLY NEWS 1880				
			MIRACLE	
WITNESS	RAINING	SPARKLE	DRY	CLOSE UP VIEW
			GABLE	
				NO - he said he went on the wall near the Church to see them. No mention of Hill's claim that he took him up closer. The priest wrote down the testimony and so it

11				is really hearsay about what the child said. It does not suffice as evidence. Nevertheless, when the priest didn't write that Curry had a close up view, its probable that he didn't have. A child could not resist saying he saw the vision close if he really did.
John Curry				
1937 New York Tribunal				
			MIRACLE	
WITNESS	RAINING	SPARKLE	DRY	CLOSE UP VIEW
			GABLE	
12	Yes - but does not say it rained all the time		Says the place where the images appeared was "quite dry". So she must have thought it was just damp.	YES
Judith Campbell				
			MIRACLE	
WITNESS	RAINING	SPARKLE	DRY	CLOSE UP VIEW
			GABLE	
13		Yes		
Margaret Beirne 2				
			MIRACLE	
WITNESS	RAINING	SPARKLE	DRY	CLOSE UP VIEW
			GABLE	
14	Says it rained at the time he arrived at the scene but does not say it rained all the time		Gable not mentioned and only says the images were dry, if the images were made of light this would be what you would expect	
Dominick Beirne Sen				

			MIRACLE	
WITNESS	RAINING	SPARKLE	DRY	CLOSE UP VIEW
			GABLE	
15				
John Durkan				

