

NON-LIVING ENTITIES SEEN AT KNOCK AND OMISSIONS BY WITNESSES OF IMPORTANT MATERIAL SUGGEST LIES AND EXAGGERATION

SOURCE: 1879 Depositions of Witnesses of "Apparition" of Mary, Joseph, John and angels on the gable of Knock Chapel.

After the reported two hour apparition, depositions were taken from the witnesses. There are clues in those statements. Was it a miracle or paranormal or something more natural?

UNDERLINED TEXT AT FACE VALUE INDICATES THE SUPERNATURAL OR INEXPLICABLE

THE BOLDED TEXT IS CLEAR EVIDENCE OF THE MAGIC LANTERN THEORY OR A NON-MIRACLE

THE REST DOESN'T INDICATE ONE WAY OR THE OTHER

THERE ARE FAR MORE BOLDED INDICATING THAT THE EVIDENCE FAVOURS A NATURAL INTERPRETATION

It matters if the entities were able to move, Otherwise we have a strange story about statues appearing or ghosts. They need to be alive, clearly alive. And it matters if they were seen in daylight. The whole episode sounds like a show typical of the time where images were projected from a magic lantern and you need the dark for that. It matters if there was a cross and altar and lamb there. These things have not been clarified satisfactorily.

WITNESS	MOVEMENT?	SEEN IN DAY-LIGHT?	ALTAR LAMB	CROSS
1 Patrick Hill	Yes he vaguely said he saw them move but this was in the context of the images seemingly coming out from the wall and going back into it rather than the figures showing any sign of life.	No - said he was told at at 8 about the vision and ran to the church and said it was very dark. The darkness probably fell early that night.	Yes	Yes
WEEKLY NEWS 1880		NO IT WAS DARK		
DAILY TELEGRAPH 1880				
WITNESS	MOVEMENT?	SEEN IN DAY-LIGHT?	ALTAR LAMB	CROSS
2 Mary McLoughlin	Didn't say what she meant by saying the images were moving. The images could have moved as a block slightly or an entity might have seemed to be breathing.	Yes	Yes	Yes

WITNESS	MOVEMENT?	SEEN IN DAY-LIGHT?	ALTAR LAMB	CROSS
3 Mary Beirne		Sort of. According to the published account - which was not authorised by her, it was still bright. Her declaration that she went away from the scene and saw the altar when she got back may imply that the vision was clearer the darker it got. Her original account says that it was a darker night than usual because of the rain. She says too that it was dusk when she first saw the images. You would expect the dark to have fallen earlier too if it was such a wet evening.	Yes	
WEEKLY NEWS 1880		Says there was good light, when asked if it was daylight. Sounds like the light was okay but not the best.		
1932 Testimony - not under oath				
1935 testimony to Liam Ua Cadhain				
1936 deathbed sworn statement for Commission			Doesn't remember a lamb or stars	
WITNESS	MOVEMENT?	SEEN IN DAY-LIGHT?	ALTAR LAMB	CROSS
4 Patrick Walsh		No		
WITNESS	MOVEMENT?	SEEN IN DAY-LIGHT?	ALTAR LAMB	CROSS
5 Patrick Beirne		No		

1932 Testimony			Lamb	
1936 Sworn statement				
WITNESS	MOVEMENT?	SEEN IN DAY-LIGHT?	ALTAR LAMB	CROSS
6 Maggie Beirne		No	Yes	Said she saw no cross
WITNESS	MOVEMENT?	SEEN IN DAY-LIGHT?	ALTAR LAMB	CROSS
7 Dominick Beirne		No		
WITNESS	MOVEMENT?	SEEN IN DAY-LIGHT?	ALTAR LAMB	CROSS
8 Mrs Flatley		Not known - she says it was 8. It seems that as she thought they were statues and nothing unusual that she saw them in daylight.		
WITNESS	MOVEMENT?	SEEN IN DAY-LIGHT?	ALTAR LAMB	CROSS
9 Bridget Trench	No	No		
WITNESS	MOVEMENT?	SEEN IN DAY-LIGHT?	ALTAR LAMB	CROSS
10 Catherine		No		

Murray				
WEEKLY NEWS 1880				
WITNESS	MOVEMENT?	SEEN IN DAY-LIGHT?	ALTAR LAMB	CROSS
11 John Curry		No		
1937 New York Tribunal	Appeared to be alive. But this contradicts his claim that Mary had a face like a statue. He also says that Bridget Trench touched nothing but the picture when she tried to touch the figures. Said he did not see the figures move.		Lamb may have been under Joseph's arm and not on the altar like the others said	
WITNESS	MOVEMENT?	SEEN IN DAY-LIGHT?	ALTAR LAMB	CROSS
12 Judith Campbell		Says she was there when night came on but could have meant she arrived at twilight not daylight.	Yes	
WITNESS	MOVEMENT?	SEEN IN DAY-LIGHT?	ALTAR LAMB	CROSS
13 Margaret Beirne 2		No	Just mentions altar	
WITNESS	MOVEMENT?	SEEN IN DAY-LIGHT?	ALTAR LAMB	CROSS
14 Dominick Beirne Sen		No	Just mentions altar	Yes
			ALTAR	

WITNESS	MOVEMENT?	SEEN IN DAY-LIGHT?	LAMB	CROSS
15 John Durkan				

