

A TRICK IS SUSPECTED AT KNOCK 1879 FOR THE LIGHTING DOES NOT SOUND LIKE A MIRACLE

Source: 1879 Depositions of Witnesses of "Apparition" of Mary, Joseph, John and angels on the gable of Knock Chapel.

After the reported two hour apparition, depositions were taken from the witnesses. There are clues in those statements. Was it a miracle or paranormal or something more natural?

UNDERLINED TEXT AT FACE VALUE INDICATES THE SUPERNATURAL OR INEXPLICABLE

THE BOLDED TEXT IS CLEAR EVIDENCE OF THE MAGIC LANTERN THEORY OR A NON-MIRACLE

THE REST DOESN'T INDICATE ONE WAY OR THE OTHER

THERE ARE FAR MORE BOLDED INDICATING THAT THE EVIDENCE FAVOURS A NATURAL INTERPRETATION

WE NEED THE ANGELS COLUMN. WHY DID THE IRISH WHO LOVE FAIRIES AND ANGELS HARDLY MENTION THEM? DID THOSE WHO SAID THEY SAW ANGELS LIE?

WITNESS	DULL LIGHT	BRIGHT LIGHT	ANGEL
1 Patrick Hill	Indicated that it was dull - he didn't see the light though he was running in the direction of the gable. He only saw it when he got closer: "When we, running southwest, came so far from the village that on our turning the gable came in view, we immediately beheld the lights, a clear, white light". Why does he talk as if the light was the most striking thing? What about the images he claimed were very distinct and clear? What about first impressions?	Bright light Covering the Gable. Believers say that no Magic Lantern could make a light that bright. But we must remember the witnesses only said there was light all over the gable. A lantern would manage to do that. The light would be brighter around where the lens was trained on and duller elsewhere.	Yes
WEEKLY NEWS 1880		LIGHT DID NOT COVER THE WHOLE GABLE AND WAS SOFT AND BRIGHT	
DAILY TELEGRAPH 1880		LIGHT DID COVER THE WHOLE GABLE. Not necessarily miraculous.	
WITNESS	DULL LIGHT	BRIGHT LIGHT	ANGELS
2 Mary McLoughlin	Does not say if the light was that bright, but she did say she could see the figures better after dark and said the light was white.		
WITNESS	DULL LIGHT	BRIGHT LIGHT	ANGELS

Created by free version of DocuFreezer

3 Mary Beirne	She says only that the body of the lamb seemed to be reflecting light - suits the view that pictures were used and light shone on them	Probably not. The light, if remarkably bright, should have been seen from her house if one looks at the ordinance survey map. Even her and McLoughlin didn't see the light until they got closer to the gable despite having a partial view of the gable from the Beirne house. This indicates the light was dull She says only that the body of the lamb seemed to be reflecting light - suits the view that pictures were used and light shone on them.	
WEEKLY NEWS 1880			
1932 Testimony - not under oath		Yes	
1935 testimony to Liam Ua Cadhain	Soft silvery light like the moon	Soft silvery light like the moon	
1936 deathbed sworn statement for Commission			
WITNESS	DULL LIGHT	BRIGHT LIGHT	ANGELS
4 Patrick Walsh		<u>Very bright light - but says it was "high up in the air above and around the chapel gable" which contradicts what some of the other witnesses said - the rest were silent. He says it was "a large globe of golden light". This contradicts the witnesses who said the light was soft and white.</u>	
WITNESS	DULL LIGHT	BRIGHT LIGHT	ANGELS
5 Patrick Beirne			
1932 Testimony			

1936 Sworn statement		<u>Whole gable bright with white light</u>	
WITNESS	DULL LIGHT	BRIGHT LIGHT	ANGELS
6 Maggie Beirne			
WITNESS	DULL LIGHT	BRIGHT LIGHT	ANGELS
7 Dominick Beirne			
WITNESS	DULL LIGHT	BRIGHT LIGHT	ANGELS
8 Mrs Flatley			
WITNESS	DULL LIGHT	BRIGHT LIGHT	ANGELS
9 Bridget Trench		Extraordinary brightness	
WITNESS	DULL LIGHT	BRIGHT LIGHT	ANGELS
10 Catherine Murray			
WEEKLY NEWS 1880			
WITNESS	DULL LIGHT	BRIGHT LIGHT	ANGELS
11 John Curry			

1937 New York Tribunal			
WITNESS	DULL LIGHT	BRIGHT LIGHT	ANGELS
12 Judith Campbell		She says first that night came on and then she mentions she saw a beautiful light shining around the figures. This seems to imply the images got clearer the darker it got.	
WITNESS	DULL LIGHT	BRIGHT LIGHT	ANGELS
13 Margaret Beirne 2		Bright light that sparkled at times - the sparkling could have been caused by the rain getting in the way of the light source.	
WITNESS	DULL LIGHT	BRIGHT LIGHT	ANGELS
14 Dominick Beirne Sen		The falsifier of his testimony has it that he said, "Bright light like the sun" but he actually merely said it was plain like the noonday sun.	
WITNESS	DULL LIGHT	BRIGHT LIGHT	ANGELS
15 John Durkan			

Created by free version of DocuFreezer

